NYPL

ECA/PHSD/HRP/90/10[6.2 OA]

UNITED NATIONS
ECONOMIC COMMISSION FOR AFRICA

Public Administration, Human Resources
and Social Development Division

REPORT OF A NATIONAL SEMINAR ON EMPLOYMENT PLANNING AND PRODUCTIVITY ENHANCEMENT STRATEGIES IN TANZANIA

LC/NAIROBI

(Organized by ECA in collaboration with
the Planning Commission of Tanzania
Dar-es-Salaam, Tanzania, 15-19 October 1990)

October 1990

A. BACKGROUND

1. Dramatic increases in levels of unemployment and underemployment have been registered within the African economy since the beginning of this decade. The socio-economic crisis, structural adjustment and the application of recovery measures have caused significant contractions in the growth of African economies, which have in turn created serious aggregate demand deficiencies. But human resources policies being pursued in many African countries as well as certain institutional regidities must share the blame for the worsening unemployment problem.

2. The situation has been 'of grave concern to most African government and to the international community. The International Conference on the Human Dimension of Africa's Economic Recovery and Development which was held in Khartoum, Sudan, in March, 1988 agreed that every indicator of human development including employment and poverty-alleviation had indicated a continuous worsening of the situation since 1980, and called for a "human focused approach to socio-economic recovery and development."

3. In like manner, the Third ECA Conference of Ministers Responsible for Human Resources Planning, Development and Utilization, meeting in Khartoum, Sudan in March 1988, endorsed the findings, conclusions and recommendations of the International Conference and went further to agree on a set of measures that should be taken by African governments to arrest the persistent declines in conditions of human wellbeing within the continent. In the area of human resources utilization, the ministers called for employment generation policy measures to be focused on the stimulation of growth in the urban informal and rural sectors of African economies to reach target groups such as unemployed youth and women workers in the rural areas. They also recommended that efforts should be intensified to align macro-economic and sectoral development policies with the need for employment creation. To do so would require some institutional reform and a fuller participation of a wider range of government institutions in employment policy formulation and plan implementation. The Executive Secretary of ECA was requested to assist African Governments in their efforts to implement the recommendations of both the International Conference on the Human Dimension of Africa's Economic Recovery and Development, and the Third Conference of Ministers Responsible for Human Resources Planning, Development and Utilization.

4. The Seminar was organized by ECA in collaboration with the Planning Commission of Tanzania in response to that request.

B. OBJECTIVES

5. The Objectives of the Seminar were:-

(i) To identify socio-economic and institutional bottlenecks that have constrained employment growth in the Tanzanian economy.

(ii) To examine education and training programmes with a view to proposing how they could be made more relevant to Tanzania's development needs and priorities, and more amenable to producing a larger number of employable skills.

(iii) To propose strategies for employment creation and productivity enhancement, and for increasing the labour absorptive capacity of the private and informal sectors.

(iv) To identify ways and means of strengthening institutional support for employment planning and the monitoring of plan implementation.

C. PARTICIPATION

6. 48 participants attended the seminar from Planning Commission, Foreign Affairs, University of Dar es Salaam, Bank of Tanzania, Jumuiya ya Wanawake, National Productivity Council, Civil Service, S I D O, Ministry of Health, C C M Headquarters, Ministry of Labour, I D M Mzumbe and Association of Tanzania Employers.

7. There were also observers from UNDP and ILO. A list of participants is annexed to this report.

D. ELECTION OF THE BUREAU

8. The Seminar elected the following bureau:

Chairman:	Dr. J. Wagao
Vice Chairman:	Prof. R. Baguma
Reporter General:	Mr. U.P. Tenende

E. OPENING

9. The Seminar was opened by Mr. A. Vuai, Principal Secretary of Labour, Culture and Social Welfare. In his opening remarks, the Principal Secretary, welcomed participants to the Seminar. He said that at present, it was difficult to assess the magnitude of the employment problem in the country because of the paucity of data on human resources utilization. It was, however, a fact that unemployment started to emerge with the development of the economic crisis in the late 1970s and the 1980s. The problem he said, manifested itself in the form of growing numbers of youth in urban areas without gainful work, and increased crime. With Tanzania's rapid population growth, the labour force was equally growing rapidly. Present new labour force entrants per year was estimated at

half a million, most of whom were literate but unskilled. The economy he said, was unable to absorb most of this addition at reasonable levels of productivity and income, resulting in widespread underemployment, unemployment, migration of youth to urban areas and declining labour producitivity in both rural and urban areas.

10. Measures taken to facilitate the access of the population of working age to productive employment included expansion of education, political campaigns, promotion of improved technology and the passing of the 1983 Human Resources Deployment Act aimed at establishing a machinery designed to regulate and facilitate the engagement of all able-bodied persons in productive work. Also efforts were being made to spread vocational training all over the country and to promote technical education and impart a vocational bias to the educational system. A National Productivity Council had been established to foster greater productivity in industry. In the predominant agricultural sector, improved labour-intensive farming practices were being promoted.

11. The Principal Secretary noted that the poor performance in the area of employment may be attributed to lack of comprehensive human resources planning. Traditionally great attention had been given to manpower planning for the modern sector and particularly the public sector in response to the need to solve the problem of scarcity of skilled manpower, run the government and manage the economy. While wage employment was currently about one million representing only 8% of the total labour force, the bulk of the labour force was engaged in non-wage employment in agriculture in the rural sector, making this sector the most important in the economy in terms of generation of income and employment opportunities. Thus the solution to Tanzania's employment problems could not be overcome if the rural sector were to be left out in human resources planning which must go beyond manpower planning for the formal sector and also should incorporate the needs of the informal sector in urban areas. Initial steps being taken towards this direction include the passing of the Human REsources Deployment Act of 1983, the launching of the Tanzania Youth Development and Employment Foundation (TYDEF) and the ongoing Informal Sector Study by the Planning Commission. These measures should be consolidated through a comprehensive approach to employment planning.

12. The Principal Secretary expressed the hope that the seminar would also give adequate attention to employment problems facing women. The important role played by women and the need to integrate them in the development process he said, were clearly stated in the country's strategies in the context of human equality. However, women's position in the field of employment continued to be limited by educational attainments and lack of access to appropriate technology. Tanzania's education was biased in favour of male students beyond the primary school

level, encouraging them to study subjects which facilitate their access to employment. In addition, among the primary school leavers only a small proportion (about 7%) entered secondary schools, and those who did not proceed to secondary schols were forced to make a sudden transition into the labour force.

13. Low labour productivity was another very serious employment problem facing the economy. Measures taken to alleviate employment problems would be meaningless if the question of productivity was not given equal priority. The seminar, therefore, provided an opportunity to consider factors responsible for the decline of productivity in all sectors of the economy.

14. In conclusion, the Principal Secretary expressed sincere appreciation and thanks to the Economic Commission for Africa and the United States Agency for International Development for making the Seminar possible through technical and financial assistance. He also expressed his gratitude to JASPA (Jobs and Skills Programme for Africa) for allowing their top executive Prof. V.P. Diejomaoh to participate. He then declared the Seminar formally open.

15. In his statement, the representative of ECA, Mr. C. Grey-Johnson welcomed participants to the National Seminar on Employment Generation and Producitivity Enhancement Strategies in Tanzania.

16. This Seminar, he said, was another in a series which African Governments had requested ECA, in collaboration with relevant specialized agencies of the United Nations, to mount in African Countries in a bid to help find solutions to a problem which was fast developing into a crisis in Africa - unemployment. ECA's activities, in line with that mandate in the field of human resources development and utilization, particularly employment generation, had involved the launching of activities in a number of countries in the region. The main objective in organizing these national activities was to facilitate the search for national solutions to the problem of unemployment within the context of each country's particular socio-economic development policy priorities and its prevailing social, economic and financial realities.

17. He noted that these efforts had borne fruit in that they had led to public policy changes designed to attack unemployment at the root. These changes had in some countries been institutional, in others, fiscal and in yet others, legislative. It is in this way that Ministries, Divisions or Departments of Manpower or Human Resources Development or Employment had sprouted all over the continent. Public and private investment policy changes designed to stimulate the labour demand and a faster rate of employment generation within the economy, had also been introduced in some African countries.

18. Yet Africa was still far from solving its unemployment problem, whose persistence had led the ECA and the OAU policy organs to request the two Secretariats along with the ILO to place before the Summit of African Heads of State and Government, the burning issue of unemployment, for their consideration in 1991.

19. He said that this was a demonstration of African governments' recognition of the gravity of the situation regarding unemployment and their resolve to addressing it at the highest level of government with a view to finding a permanent solution to it.

20. He said that Tanzania had been in the forefront in the promotion of human development not only within its border, but beyond. He expressed the hope that this monster of unemployment would not turn out to be the agent that would reverse Tanzania's laudable gains in this respect, over the years.

21. It was therefore the gravest responsibility of the Seminar to work diligently in order to come up with a realistic assessment of the problem and to recommend to the relevant authorities of government, courses of action that may be embarked upon to find a quick and lasting solution to Tanzania's problem of unemployment.

22. He expressed confidence that the seminar would live up to that responsibility.

23. The Chairman then invited Prof. V.P. Diejomaoh, Director, ILO/JASPA to say a few words. The Director began by transmitting the best regards of the ILO Dar es Salaam Director who could not be present in person at the seminar because of other prior engagements.

24. He recalled that the ILO had been in the forefront of the search for solutions to the unemployment problem not only in Africa, but throughout the world. He recalled further, the convening of the World Employment Conference which gave birth to the basic needs approach to development and came up with the maxim of "development with a human face".

25. With the advent of structural adjustment in the 1980's he said, it had been necessary to reemphasise the basic needs strategy of development to protect the human dimension and to ensure that it becomes the very center of development planning.

26. Finally, he expressed the hope that the seminar would help relaunch these initiatives of the early 1970s, in Tanzania and would contribute meaningfully to the search for realistic solutions to national problems of employment.

F. ACCOUNT OF PROCEEDINGS

(a) Session 1

Enhancing Employment Prospects in Tanzania: The Challenge for Policies, Programmes and Institutions:

27. The Director, Jobs and Sills Programme for Africa (ILO/JASPA) presented a Paper entitled "Enhancing, Employment Prospects in Tanzania: The Challenge for Policies, Programmes and Institutions." He said that the Tanzanian economy needed to create approximately 300,000 new jobs every year if the employment situation was to be stabilised. This represented about twice as much as the number of jobs that were required to stabilise the situation two decades ago. During the past two decades, in addition, Tanzania's economic fortunes had been seriously undercut by harsh exogenous shocks, including drought, deteriorating terms of trade and crippling debt burdens. Since the early 1980s, the Government had undertaken commendable efforts to adjust the economy to an increasingly hostile international environment. The declining trend in per-capita income had been arrested and there were some signs of renewed economic activity in the country. The economy had been growing at about 4% per annum 1986 - 1989 with GDP per capita rising by about 1% per annum. However, the recovery ramained very fragile and had so far not resulted in a significant degree of structural transformation of the economy. On the contrary, the agricultural sector was more than ever, the backbone of the economy and remained essentially subsistence-oriented. Moreover, the prospects for an agricultural export-led growth path looked uncertain because of the depressed and volatile world market prices for Tanzania's export crops. At the same time, the performance of the manufacturing sector continued to be disappointing. Hence, it would appear that optimism about the medium-term economic prospects remained to a large extent, questionable.

28. The ILO/JASPA Director said that the economic crisis of the 1980s and the ensuing adjustment and recovery programmes had not been without their social costs, in particular with regard to the labour market situation. The major events that took place on the Tanzania labour markets during the 1980s could be summarised as follows: First, real wages declined to unrealistically low levels and were well below their efficiency level. Secondly, the growth in wage employment had been faltering. The public sector had significantly reduced its labour intake while private sector wage employment had continued to fall. Thirdly, the informal sector had become a major urban labour sponge. Fourthly, the domestic terms of trade changed in favour of the rural population so that the employment prospects in rural areas looked better than in urban areas. Finally, the education profile of the labour force, which was already low by African standards, would decline further in the future because of the substantial drop in school enrolment ratios. In short, labour market informalisation had taken place during the 1980s.

29. He went on to say that currently, the modern sector generated less than 5 per cent of the number of jobs required. This means that most of the incremental labour force would have to be absorbed in the informal and traditional sectors. Since open unemployment was basically a transient phenomenon on the Tanzanian labour market, and typically a characteristic of the youth, the real challenge was underemployment, not unemployment. The critical issue was how to employ productively the thousands of youngsters who join every year in the informal and agricultural workforce.

30. Because of all of this, the paper advocated the need for policy, programme, and institutional reforms in relation to the employment generation objective.

31. The economic crisis of the 1980s had added a sense of urgency to the issue. The consensus was growing that standard adjustment and recovery programmes would not be sufficient to tackle the employment problem in an adequate manner. What was needed was a more comprehensive, consistent and longer-term package of policy reforms and targeted employment-related activities. The paper tried to outline some elements of an employment-oriented development strategy for Tanzania.

32. In summing up, the ILO/JASPA Director said that it would appear that the road to economic recovery and development in Tanzania was likely to be long and uphill. Since adjustment would be a lengthy and painful process, there was need for increased social consensus in amendments to, and implementation of, the Economic Recovery Programme. Social consensus was a critical factor in maintaining the political commitment to the implementation of adjustment programmes. Hence, the design of such programmes should not remain the monopoly of the ministries of finance, economic affairs or planning, but should be a shared responsibility, involving the ministries concerned with human resources and employment, as well as the social partners, in particular the workers and employers organisation. This point he said, was reiterated during the recent ILO Tripartite Symposium on Structural Adjustment and Employment in Africa, held in Nairobi in October 1989. This approach was further amplified and extended in the call for popular participation in the development and economic recovery process made by the International Conference on Popular Participation held in Arusha in February 1990.

33. In discussing Prof. Diejomaoh's paper on "Enhancing Employment Prospects in Tanzania: The Challenge for Policies, Programmes and Institutions", the seminar participants observed that the labour force in Tanzania was growing at a faster rate than the rate of economic growth. They also noted that the formal sector was employing a very small proportion of the labour force, hence the need to support the informal and rural sectors which could generate significantly employment.

34. Some participants cautioned against relying too much on the informal sector as an laternative source of employment generation and wondered for how long it could continue to sustain its employment generation capacity. They saw the need for the government to pursue policies which treat both the formal and the informal sectors as an integrated whole.

35. The participants noted with concern that real wages had been falling in the formal sector. As a result, people were engaging in some informal activities to supplement their meagre incomes from the formal sector jo' they held.

36. They were of the view that JASPA should continue advising Tanzania on the unemployment problem because of its complexity and magnitude. Unemployment was mostly concentrated in urban areas where it was visible and destabilising.

37. The Seminar participants also noted that at present there was little relationship between education and employment. Education had not been sufficiently geared towards generating employment. They felt that in providi g education, there was need to concentrate on the quality of education, and to impart skills from the lowest to the highest level that could be easily utilized in the economy.

(b) Session 2.
The Problem of Unemployment in African Countries

38. Crispin Grey-Johnsnon of the ECA made a presentation under this discussion item. He said that his presentation was intended to highlight the issues of unemployment that were common to all African countries in the hope that the seminar would find some of the analysis and the recommendations pertinent in the national context.

39. Up to very recently, he said, employment was defined in terms of age (15 - 64 constituting the labour force); time (35 - 40 hours of work per week); intensity of work; monetary renumeration (pay or profit). Applied to the African situation, this definition left out a large number of people in the labour force who produce goods and provide services and not necessarily receiving salaries or wages for doing so. Typically, those affected included subsistence peasant farmers, housewives, informal sector workers and the very old.

40. A more realistic definition for use by African Labour Statisticians and employment planners recognised that employment encompassed all activities entailing the production of goods and the provision of services which are of social, economic and cultural value to members of a community. The obverse of this definition would describe unemployment:

the existence of able-bodied people seeking, unsuccessfully, to be engaged in activities entailing the production of goods or the provision of services which would be of social, economic or cultural value to members of a community. The definition would embrace all producers in the subsistence/agricultural and the informal sectors of the African economy.

41. With this measurement tool at hand, employment was found to be zero or negligible in the agricultural sector; non-existent in the informal sector where labour force participation was assumed to be in the form of employment; and was prevalent in the formal wage sector which is urban-based.

42. The real employment problem in the agricultural and informal sectors, he said, was one of underemployment, which denotes relatively low labour productivity. In these sectors workers expend much time and energy only to produce relatively little in terms of volume and of value.

43. Mr. Grey-Johnson then went on to discuss seven causes of the unemployment problem:

1. Aggregate demand deficiency caused by the contraction of the African economy in the 1980s thereby causing a significantly reduced demand for labour;

2. Frictional unemployment: Skills being produced by the education system cannot be used by employers at the workplace;

3. Weak or inadequate institutional structures and infrastructures for monitoring labour and employment market behaviour;

4. Deficient public policies which fail to establish linkages between the production and economic sectors or ensure that investment is geared towards employment creation;

5. Attitudinal factors from home and school which inculcate in the young a preference for wage/salary employment in the formal sector;

6. Rapid population growth and consequently rapid labour force growth overtaking the expansion of the economy and its absorptive capacity;

7. Structural adjustment which had directly reduced employment levels particularly in the public sector and indirectly in the productive sectors of the economy by diverting investments away from these sectors such that the labour demand became depressed.

44. These causes, he said, had converged to create a trend of rapid unemployment growth. Between 1980 and 1989, unemployment grew from an estimated 10 million to 33 million workers in the African economy. Underemployment increased from an estimated 40 million to 90 million workers between 1985 and 1989/90.

45. The ECA representative in conclusion, proposed five courses of action which African Governments should embark upon to remedy the situation:

1. Formulation of employment policies;

2. Formulation of employment plans and programmes;

3. Recognition of the importance of all production sectors, particularly the agricultural and informal sectors as potential job-creators;

4. Strengthening of Government institutions for employment creation;

5. Promotion of education and training for employment.

Strategies for Improving the Labour Absorptive Capacity of the Public, Private and Informal Sector

46. Dr. M.S.D. Bagachwa presented a paper under this discussion item. He began with a definition of the public sector (to include parastatals) the private sector (distinct by majority private ownership) and the informal sector (activities outside government control, benefit and regulation).

47. He then gave a brief overview of the evolution of employment generation in the public sector from colonial times through the post Arusha Declaration era, showing how the massive growth of the parastatal sector contributed to high levels of employment in the economy.

48. Conversely, private sector employment declined steadily over the years from 1961 due mainly to Government regulation of private sector activities in the economy. He identified certain factors constraining greater efficiency, productivity and consequently effectiveness in employment creation in the parastatal sector as being:

1. Absence of careful planning and co-ordination

2. Expansion beyond technical and managerial capacity

3. Excessive state interference without control

4. Inadequacy of incentives

5. Excessive protection

6. Absence of competition

49. Turning of the Private sector, he said that, during the three decades of independence government had promoted the development of large scale public sector enterprises at the expense of private and informal sectors. Thus the public sector enjoyed preferential access to credit, foreign exchange concessions and protection from competition through subsidies, tariffs, quotas and exclusive licences.

50. Depsite its contribution to both employment and output and its observed efficiency the private sector was denied similar government support. It did not even appear in government plans. There is therefore need for the Tanzanian government:

(i) to include the private sector in its development plans particularly those relating to long term strategies for employment and growth.

(ii) Encouraging the development of the private sector through the newly introduced Investment Promotion Center.

(iii) Shifting state spending from unproductive public enterprises toward support for infrastructure and services and the private sector. This should be accompanied by selective privatisation of unproductive public sector firms.

(iv) Removing barriers to the entry of certain productive activities.

(v) Developing a neutral policy environment that is conductive to the development of both private and public sectors.

51. The informal sector is a particularly important source of employment and income for the disadvantaged groups such as women and children. In the Arusha and Dar es Salaam (Tanzania) surveys, 75% of the total employment in food vending, 32% in tailoring and 5% in carpentry were women. Such informal activities give women a way to escape social restrictions, by strengthening their economic status in the household.

52. The potential significance of the informal sector's contribution to employment became more pronounced in Tanzania as opportunities for expanding formal employment declined. Between 1983 and 1989 the increase in potential labour force was estimated to be about 2 million persons, while only 45,000 new jobs were created in the formal sector.

53. The critical constraints of the informal sector include lack of capital funds, and a discriminatory macro-policy environment. Credit and trade policies have generally favoured large scale formal enterprises. Banks avoid lending to the informal sector on grounds of lack of collateral and higher risks of default. Government and City authorities deny them business sites and are subjected to constant harassment.

54. If unemployment is to be curbed, the Tanzanian government would have to take deliberate steps to support these labour intensive, higher value added activities. Already there is evidence of declining formal employment opportunities. The existing labour force growth imply the creation of about 200,000 new jobs annually. Yet between 1984 and 1987 only 22,000 wage employment jobs were created. Thus the scope for creating more jobs in the formal sector is very limited.

55. Supportive programmes should include improvements in rural transportation and provision of social utilities such as water and electricity so as to reduce costs and raise overall project profitability.

56. Furthermore a neutral macro policy environment regime should be introduced. Government through the Bank of Tanzania should offer guarantees against the risks of informal sector thus creating an atmosphere of confidence in financing the neglected sector. This should be accompanied by flexible lending procedures that incorporate the special features of small borrowers. Emphasis should be on project viability, skill, experience and character of the borrower instead of colleral security. Lastly both SIDO and the NBC are ill-equiped administratively to finance the informal sector. A specialized bank should therefore be established to cater solely for the needs of the small scale business and informal sectors.

57. In discussing Mr. Grey-Johnson's paper on the Problem of Unemployment in African countries and Dr. Bagachwa's paper on Strategies for Improving the Labour Absorptive Capacity of the Public, Private and Informal Sectors, the Seminar Participants observed that the problem of unemployment had still not been given adequate attention. It was also felt that in defining unemployment there was need to broaden the scope so that it captured the reality in the African context: Viz the production of goods and the provision of services in agriculture and in the informal sectors. They noted that studies which had been conducted on the unemployment problem indicated that unemployment was prevalent in the formal sector, but also existed in the informal as well.

58. During the Economic Recovery Programme I, the agricutlural sector in Tanzania received much investment support, but the employment effects had been disappointing in spite of the introduction of small scale industries in the rural areas.

59. The informal sector needs to be supported, because it generates employment, but not all activities in this sector need this support. Activities which have great potential for employment creation have to be identified and provided support to enhance their employment generation capacities. Such support need not necessarily come from the government alone. Non-governmental Organisations like the Tanzania Youth Development and Employment Foundation and the Entrepreneurial Development Fund could contribute towards this end.

60. The participants observed that experience shows that the private sector does better in terms of productivity than the public sector. The managerial personnel and the personnel in the public sector lack the enterpreneurial spirit and there are many cases of managers eating up the funds of their organizations. They also lack creativeness and inovativeness.

61. They noted that although the private sector is doing better in terms of productivity than the public sector, its record is not good in other areas. For example, it is very discriminatory to women employees, the youth, the handicapped etc.

62. Evidence also shows that without the public sector, the private sector cannot perform optimally.

63. The participants felt that the informal sector does not represent a symptom of the weakness of the formal sector. It has always been there, it is real and it is the basis of indigenous entrepreneurship.

(c) Session 3

An overview of the Tanzanian Economy

64. Mr. Odunga made a presentation under this discussion item. He began with a review of Tanzania's economic performance in an attempt to establish the relationship between economic performance and employment; the evolution of employment in various sectors especially agriculture, informal sector and wage sector; and causal relationship between economic performance and unemployment.

65. He said that, overall in macro-economic terms, Tanzania's economy had essentially been in crisis through three district stages:

1977 - 1980:

1977 - 1980: Commodity boom especially coffee price rises which contributed to recovery from the first oil shock and drought of early 1970s resulting in average real GDP growth of 2.5% during 1978 - 90 compared to 0.4% in 1977.

1981 - 1983: Deep recession with average GDP registered a real growth decline of 0.8% per year.

1984 - date: Some recovery signals registering positive GDP growth of 3.4% in 1984 and 4% between 1986 and 1989.

66. The economic crisis was a consequence of both external and internal factors: There was the second oil price shock of 1979, the break-up of the East African Community; and the war of aggression of Iddi Amin. Internal factors include weak management capacity and inadequate emphasis on the directly productive sectors.

67. To redress this situation, the Government initiated several stabilization and structural adjustment programmes starting with MGP in 1981, to SAP, to ERPI and currently ERPII or ESAP. The overriding constraint appears to be the inadequate availability of foreign exchange as exhibited in the trends of growth of total imports, GDP and employment.

68. As a result of these adverse economic conditions real unemployment problems emerged and were getting more serious although so far the Government had not adequately addressed itself to them. Indeed, definitional problems and non-existence of an explicit employment policy were main issues for tackling the problem of unemployment in agriculture, the informal and formal sectors.

69. He observed that in the circumstances of Tanzania it had been difficulty to establish the linkage between output and employment in the economy as a whole and within sectors, although the evidence showed that GDP growth correlated negatively with employment growth.

70. He then went on to make the following recommendations:

a. The starting point should be the preparation of an explicit employment policy which would provide guidelines for employment promotion and identify priority employment sectors.

b. There is an increased scope for future employment in sectors other than the public sector and thus there was need for formal recognition of this fact.

c. Creation of appropriate institutional framework.

d. Provision of incentive packages to employment creating firms and informal sector enterprices.

e. Protection and training opportunities for informal sector operators.

71. In the ensuing discussions, participants observed that the scope for employment creation in the public sector was limited, so there was need to support the agricultural and informal sectors with additional incentives for employment generation. They also noted that in Tanzania there was no relationship between economic performance (output) and employment. It was noted that although labour is the source of value, a distinction needed to be made between labour which creates value and that which does not. It was also observed that in trying to tackle the problem of declining productivity the immediate solution had been to retrench the workers rather than to consider other factors which increased operational costs. The participants felt that it was necessary to go down to enterprise level and consider other expenses like managerial and overhead costs rather than labour costs.

72. They observed that at present there was a trend towards economic integration in the Southern region in the form of PTA and SADCC. It was also noted that OAU had finalised a draft treaty which seeks to form the African Economic Community. The participants thought that Tanzania should either put herself in a position to take advantage of the market of the subregion, or she should defend her internal production in the new economic environment which is emerging.

73. The participants expressed their worries with regard to the data management capacities. They were of the view that the data used in planning was not always authentic. For example, when the National Economic Survival Programme (NESP) was launched, it was projected that production of cotton would double without even communicating with the farmers to incorporate fully the realities. Finally, the participants echoed the need to increase the level of technology in the agricultural sector with a view to increasing productivity.

(d) Session 4
Policies and Programmes for Employment Creation in Tanzania

74. Prof. R. Baguma and Mr. D.S. Dandi introduced this discussion item. the presentation started by postulating the employment creation function, which is conditioned by the interplay of the following variables, namely, public policies, incentives, social peace, levels of income, consumption, investment, economic growth, levels of exports and imports, technology, credit, foreign assistance and popular participation.

75. Further the authors cautioned that employment creation must be looked at from a wider perspective whereby it focused on providing opportunities to able-bodied people within the relevant working age-groups to participate in legal income-generating activities on a continuous basis; rather than concentrate on wage-employment in the formal sector. The authors then traced the historical development during the colonial period, before elaborating on the evolution of employment creation policies after independence.

76. Altogether they identified three distinct phases, phase one was immediately after independence when the main focus was localization of middle and senior posts in the civil service, by the year 1980, as contained in the 15 Year Social and Economic Perspective Plan of 1985, which guided subsequent post-primary education planning. They noted that during this phase employment creation was guided by the specific skill needs in the public service. The second phase started after 1962 and is reflected in the Ujamaa vijijini (Rural socialism) and education for self-reliance policies, which focused on the creation of conditions for, and an atmosphere conducive to easy participation of village community members and graduates of the lower education system in economic endeavors at their relevant areas of settlement, rather than focusing on the provision of specific skills. They noted that these goals were not met.

77. The third phase started in the 1980s when it was recognized that as a result of various factors, Universal Primary Education, the economic crisis etc., unemployment especially of the youth was becoming a national social problem. The Government initiated various measures, the most remarkable being the Human Resources Deployment Act of 1983, which required all able bodied people to be engaged in lawful employment generating an income. The Act provided for the mechanism for administering the provisions of the Act, including identification of the unemployed, activities in which they could be deployed and the necessary training to be provided. Unfortunately, they noted, the policy failed to realize its objectives, particularly because of inefficient organizational arrangements among the central implementing agencies, and also due to lack of Government support. The authors then noted that due to the failure of those policies the unemployment problem had intensified. They then proceeded to recommend the following measures to contain the situation.

78. First, that since agriculture broadly defined, has the greatest potential for employment creation, deliberate measures should be taken to professionalize it, to make it more productive, remunerative and respectable and therefore attractive to new entrants, and capable of retaining those already there.

79. Second, that the education system should provide skills in various trades to its recipients to prepare them either for wage employment or self-employment, and;

80. Thirdly, there should be a reactivation of the Human Resources Deployment Act, by providing an appropriate institutional framework, and the requisite Government support.

81. Finally, the authors emphasised the overall need for the Government to provide an enabling environment to enable any specific suggestion to succeed.

Training for Employment

82. Dr. Faustin Mukyanuzi made a presentation under this discussion item. He said that there appeared to be two conflicting views:

That on the one hand, manpower self sufficiency was not increasing substantially while on the other hand, there were increased percentages of shcool leavers who were not being selected for the formal sector.

This trend was seen as a symptom of skill imbalances in the economy, manifested in various forms, namely skill inadequacy; skill inappropriateness, skill mismanagement, skill misallocation and skill exfoliation.

83. In response to these imbalances, various efforts were made partly by the Education Ministry and the Government in general. As far as educational efforts were concerned, ESR was introduced. The underlying motive was to impart skills and knowledge to students, who were to be able to undertake direct employment and self employment, respectively, in the formal and rural sectors. This would make education complete-in-itself.

84. On the part of the Government, rural policies including the National agricultural policy and Human Resources Deployment Act was introduced.

85. The assessment of these attempts was not adequately successful. Practically all research had shown that school graduates had not opted for self employment in the rural sector.

86. In view of these unsuccessful attempts, the paper proposed that:

(i) Efforts should be made to introduce social change by applying the structuralist rather than the technicalist approach. The former implies making the rural environment socially and economically enabling so that it would attract school leavers to make a living there rather than fleeing to urban areas. The technicalist approach which had hitherto been applied saw education as the main agent for change. Specifically he recommended that the following courses of action be considered seriously:

Education

(ii) Education at both the primary and secondary levels should emphasize physical sciences and technical education.

(iii) The educational inputs have to be mobilized and effectively used so as to improve educational quality.

Training

(iv) Research and assessment of training needs should be intensified so as to satisfy employers' demands.

(v) Co-ordination between Ministry of Education and Ministry of Labour should be strengthened.

(vi) Regional Administration should be in full charge of planning by first assessing the needs and aspirations of the youth and policy in general.

(vii) Reward incentives and structures should be reviewed and adjusted.

87. In discussing Prof. Baguma's and Mr. Dandi's paper entitled "Policies and Programmes for Employment Creation in Tanzania", and Dr. Mukyanuzi's paper entitled "Training for Employment" the seminar participants warned against the ad hoc nature of policy making in Tanzania. There was a problem of shuttling from one policy to another without considering their inter-relatedness. They also wondered whether all the state organs understood some of the policies and Acts. They cited the Human Resources Deployment Act and stressed that not all organs of government had the same perception or understanding of this Act. They observed that from 1985 no money had been allocated to "Nguvukazi" and wondered whether the target group of "Nguvukazi" appreciated it.

(g) Session 5

PARTICIPATION OF WOMEN IN EMPLOYMENT

88. Mrs. Darry Ibrahim presented a paper under this item. She said that Tanzania was predominately an agricultural country with the majority of the people working in peasant agriculture. Women constituted almost 75% of the agricultural work-force. Despite their contribution to the economy she said, women were the most neglected portion of this society.

89. To place the problem of women within its historical perspective, she pointed out that women in the traditional society had no right to own land, though there were some exceptions in tribes like the Zaramo, and the Luguru. Families treated girls as a source of wealth (dowry) while boys were regarded as source of security and were regarded as a catalyst in the kinship cycles.

90. Apart from bearing and rearing the children, women participated in decision-making at family and community levels. They were also responsible for shaping morals and behaviour of people within that community.

91. She then said that the coming of Europeans destroyed the traditional structures. Men migrated to towns to work in plantations, mines and industries. Women assumed new roles as heads of the households. Their position became worse due to increased work load; they worked both in subsistence and cash crop production.

92. She went on to say that the colonial administration introduced formal education. Boys were given first priority and the few girls who joined schools were trained in subjects considered natural for women, like cookery, typing, needle work, nursing and teaching. The type of training that one received determined the type of employment one could aspire to.

93. She argued that during the struggle for independence, women participated fully in the liberation struggle and gave both material and moral support. Women had great hopes because they thought independence would change their status in society.

94. Regarding women's contribution in agriculture, she said Tanzania depends on small holder agricultural producers. The sector employs about 90% of the country's labour force. About 90% of the total food requirements are locally produced. Women produced more than half the food produced in the third world. Women constitute 60% to 80% of agricultural workers in Africa and Asia. In Tanzania women constitute 75% of the active population engaged in agriculture. Despite the great contribution in agriculture, women do not own land, therefore, they have no access to credit and modern tehcnology. Worse still, national statistics on economic activities neglect women's contribution in the Gross National Product.

95. Concerning women in employment she observed that in the formal employment, some modest achievements had been registered. After the Arusha Declaration the number of women in employment had increased. This was influenced by government policies based on equality of sexes. In 1977, ten years after the Declaration, the number of women in the formal sector was 40,969 compared to that of men who were 322,526. In 1967 the number stood at 14,405 while in 1960 women were 13,883 against 233,230 men (1961).

96. Regarding women in the informal sector she said that women are the majority, they usually work as petty traders, they are poor and illiterate, they frequently work under unhygienic conditions, they have little access to credit facilities and training opportunites.

97. As for the reasons why women involve themselves in the informal sector, she mentioned three:

(i) To subsidize family income due to economic hardships.

(ii) Low education forces women to engage themselves in petty business to top up their low salaries.

(iii) There are less bureaucratic procedures involved when a person wants to join the informal sector.

98. She then identified 6 constraints which face women operators in the informal sector; namely:

(i) Insecurity:- Business is usually run by family members with a small capital, hence in case of anything - say death, or theft, business collapses.

(ii) No government recognition. There is no law to defend the rights of people employed in this sector. They are subjected to harassment.

(iii) No access to credit, training or insurance services.

(iv) Lack of training opportunities. Everyone depends on personal skill and experience. Therefore the son becomes a tailor or mason like the father.

(v) Inadequate support services like day care centers, or clubs.

(vi) Lack of data. This is the least documented sector of the economy.

99. She then went on to suggest 5 measures which could help to emancipate women.

/e

(a) Consciousness raising: Awareness must be developed among women and the community at large. Women should be helped to identify their needs. Gender discrimination and stereotype elements should be abolished/discouraged, through e.g. curriculum, teaching methods, text books, radio, T.V. programmes drama, religions gatherings, etc..

(b) National Policies:
There must be a National Policy to protect women and children's rights. The policy should ensure that there is a reallocation of the country's resources to promote women's self determination and dignity.

(c) Data Bank
The planning commission should establish a data bank on women activities to help in programme design and policy formulation.

(d) Integrated Projects
Women's component should be accommodated in all projects. This would help to improve farming methods, reduce work load, increase access to social services e.g. appropriate food processing technologies, free women from time and energy consuming tasks, improve health of mothers and children, increase productivity and incomes for women etc.

(e) Establishing an autonomous women organisation.

100. She concluded by emphasizing the combined factors which limit the full participation of women in national development activities; namely,

a. Traditional practices which oppress and exploit women
b. Low level of education
c. Poor technology
d. Non-recognition or accounting of women's work, and
e. Attitudes and institutions which perpetuate inequality.

101. Mr. Alfred I.A. Mwenisongole also made a presentation on the Participation of Women in Employment in Tanzania.

102. He said that for a long time, Tanzanian women had been weighed down by traditions, by the education system, by religion (both, traditional and foreign) and by men who were the enforcers of social norms and attitudes towards women.

103. He said that women constitute more than 50% of the population and were important and active agents in the economy. However, few employment and educational opportunities had been secured even after the long-term perspective plan for self-sufficiency in high level manpower. Present statistics showed that the place of women participation in high positions in the public sector was still not satisfactory. There was therefore need for a clear policy to be instituted to speed-up women participation in employment backed by a programme of action in this respect, to change the situation in the short, medium and long-term in the areas of education, training and employment.

104. In discussing the presentations, the Seminar participants observed that women constitute 50% of the labour force and 60% of agrarian producers. In terms of employment, they constitute 60% of the operators in the informal sector. One woman in the informal sector supports an average of 6 - 8 other people. It was noted that women have proven to be better business managers and retailers than men. Because of the important role they play in society, the Seminar participants felt that there is need to have a more positive and balanced outlook on the efforts of women towards their own advancement. Development programmes should therefore take into account the affairs of women.

105. The participants noted that the Women Organization (UWT) had made some efforts towards women's emancipation, but these efforts had created some undesirable side effects like broken marriages etc.

106. Another observation they made was that women in wage/salary employment were by and large getting equal rights with men, but this was not so with women who were agricultural producers in the rural areas.

107. They also observed that the customary law in Tanzania was still favouring men, so there was need to review it, so that women would also get fair treatment.

IMPROVING THE EFFICIENCY OF EMPLOYMENT PLANNING AND LABOUR ADMINISTRATION IN TANZANIA

108. A paper was presented by Mr. W.L. Itala under this discussion item. He started by defining employment planning as a process through which human resources requirements of a country or an organization are identified over a time horizon and efforts to produce the required resources are made. He said that it had to be very closely linked to economic planning, for, national economic goals point to the profile of certain employment patterns the economy should take in the future. He went on to say that Employment planning was also linked to educational planning, for the latter is concerned with the desired establishment and expansion of the education and training system required to produce the required skills. Further, employment is commonly taken to mean work on hire for wages, but wage employment in Tanzania constituted

a very small fraction of the labour force. Thus the effectiveness of any employment policy and plan had to be measured by what it did to raise the productivity of the whole labour force, i.e. including the labouring masses who are self-employed. Employment planning, therefore, had to encompass the development, and optimal utilization of all the available labour resources.

109. He argued that the institutional framework for employment planning and labour administration in Tanzania, had gone through a number of changes, but had concentrated too much on the development and deployment of high and middle level manpower. Besides, drawing a manpower plan and investment plan, each in isolation of the other, left a gap between policy formulation, planning, and implementation. A co-ordinating body, ideally located in the Planning Commission which is the interested party in seeing how its policies are implemented, should be established to which the Ministry of Education, Labour Exchange Bureaus, and the NHLMAC would periodically be reporting and would be continuously monitored.

110. He said that the quality of education in the country needed to be raised in line with the policy of "Education for Self-Reliance". Apart from equipping students at the various terminal levels of education with the skills, knowledge, and attitudes to make them self-reliant, he suggested that a fund should be established from which they would draw resources for investment when they completed their studies. Furthermore, a fundamental change in the production relations in the rural life is needed to make it more respectable so that school leavers should always nurse ideas of going back to the rural sector when they graduate to participate in its various activities.

111. He went further to say that the formulation and implementation of an employment policy to ensure optimum productive employment of the labour force, the labour absorptive capacity of the economy should be established ex-ante. Intakes into the various education categories should be in such a way that they fulfill the future demand of skills in the economy. At the same time, a labour market information system should be established so that students in the various courses should know in advance the skills that are in short supply and be encouraged to acquire them. They should also receive information on the policies for the deployment or gradual curtailment of the supply of labour when feasible economic development in the near future cannot absorb all the existing and growing number of future school-leavers in the education biases. Thus Career Counselling and Guidance as spelt out in Staff Circular No. 5 of 1990 should not only be established in institutions of higher learning but should be expanded to the secondary school level.

112. He pointed out that, the country had been producing manpower to the "extent justified by manpower requirements for development". The recent development in which private secondary schools had outnumbered the public secondary schools made the central allocation system outmoded in the manner in which it was originally conceived to operate, and this resulted in more than 50% of Form IV leavers being unplaced in jobs in 1987 alone.

113. He concluded by saying that in the wake of the silent move towards universalizing secondary education, the NHLMAC should leave the allocation of secondary shcool leavers to the open labour market system while all its efforts should be concentrated in allocating, deploying, and monitoring the utilization of category A skills outlined in Staff Ciruclar No. 5 of 1990. Furthermore, the labour exchange Bureaus should be re-established, one in each region, unlike the NHLMAC, which is centralised in Dar es Salaam only. These should be charged with the duty to administer the labour market information system in their regional areas as they would be in a better position to know their local labour market conditions than the NHLMAC.

114. In the discussions that followed, the seminar participants observed that the idea of manpower planning for the whole economy and then allocating manpower to the public sector alone was self defeating. A need was felt to consider the private sector also when allocating manpower.

115. They went on to observe that the country had been investing in education and training to meet the demand of the economy, in order to avoid creating a pool of educated unemployed. In recent years the government had allowed the establishment of private secondary schools so that at present, they outnumber the public schools. As a result up to 50% of the school leavers do not get employed. There is need therefore, to do something about this. They noted that in order to tackle this problem the government had established employment promotion centers to provide guidance to school leavers, help the placement officers to slot the right people in to the right jobs, and be centres of labour market information.

116. They observed that a number of measures had already been taken towards this direction. The ministry of Labour, Culture and Social Welfare had already launched a project which seeks to start employment promotion centers. A labour statistics unit had been started in the same ministry to take care of the labour market information.

117. The participants also saw the need to introduce career guidance and counselling in schools so that students are encouraged to pursue subjects which could give them opportunities for employment in the labour market. It was felt that as the country liberalises the economy, the labour exchange bureaux would be necessary.

(f) **Session 6**
Strategies for Improving Worker Productivity

118. Mr. A.T. Maenda presented a paper for discussion under this item. He said productivity increase should bring about two things:

(a) raising the living standards and sustenance of those standards so as to make sure that productivity growth continues.

(b) creation of a win-win situation i.e. there is no loser: individuals, the nation and future generation gain.

119. He said that employment generation had to be seen in its totality and that three principal issues should be addressed; the first was the policy and institutional framework which facilitates employment generation and enhancement of worker productivity. The second was how worker productivity and institutions enhance worker productivity and generate employment. The third was what could be done in view of the problems which are discussed.

120. The paper presenter revisited Government Paper No. 4 of 1967 issued after Prof. Turner of ILO had submitted his report. Government Paper No. 4 of 1967 emphasised the following:

(a) Bridging the gap between incomes of wage earners and these of the peasants.

(b) Restriction of wage increases to 5% of the wage bill except where PBR schemes operated.

(c) Wages and Incomes Policy must avoid excessive accumulation of wealth.

(d) Creation of the Permanent Labour Tribunal as the principal body to facilitate the implementation of Government Paper No. 4 of 1964: i.e. negotiating machinery.

121. He went on to point out that:

(a) Wage employment had grown faster than GDP growth.

(b) Wage Employment growth had not been a function of or dependent upon growth of GDP.

(c) This could suggest that wage employment grew out of deliberate policy decisions rather than an outcome of economic growth. This was corroborated by the decision to declare redundancies in the Public sector in 1985. The link between employment growth and economic growth has been broken.

122. He then talked about Productivity enhancement (Evaluation) Government Paper No. 4 of 1967: which he said had no clear guidelines for enterprises on productivity enhancement. Enterprises ventured into their own innovations which caused some problems to some public enterprises.

123. By contrast, he said, Government Paper No. 1 of 1981 made attempts to provide guidelines to enterprises and emphased the principle of pegging wage increases to productivity increase. It also allocated roles and called for studies to be made on work norms and the carrying out of work study.

124. The PLT was again given a big role in registering production targets, bonus application, voluntary agreements and even went on to give a deadline of 30 - August 1983 by which date all enterprises should have registered production targets and incentive schemes.

125. He then pointed out the Shortcomings of Government Paper No. 1 of 1981:

(a) It was not a product of comprehensive research on enterprise performance in Tanzania.

(b) No study of employment trends vis-a-vis productivity trends had been conducted, hence redundancies came just 4 years after.

(c) It was conceived at the top and handed down to industry as an article of faith. There was no involvement of industry, and workers. Because of this it did not have the enthusiasm of workers and employers.

126. Mr. Maenda then outlined the Institutional framework of Productivity Management in Tanzania.

- The Planning Commission: National Economic Policy
- The NIP - Consultancy: Training
- NPC - Studies and advice to Government, Industry and Workers Productivity
- PLT - Register Production Targets, decide on Bonus Applications
- ATE & JUWATA - Representation services and advisory services to their constituencies

127. He observed the following constraints in the operations of these institutions

NIP: (a) Little demand for services from Industry because of little productivity awareness in industry.
(b) Capacity: low capacity, shortage of manpower and finance.
NPC: - Capacity: low capacity, shortage of manpower and finance.

ATE & JUWATE: Low Capacity and emphasis on other priorities in Industrial relations.

PLT: As a court it can only act on what is fed to it.

128. He concluded by suggesting what could be done to improve the situation.

(a) Role of Government.
The government should provide an enabling environment for growth of enterprises e.g. - training, planning. The Government should not be the omnipresent omnipotent businessman. It should involve all sectors, and all agents in the economy in policy and programme formulation.

(b) NIP and NPC should be strengthened so that they could help enhance industry's own productivity.

(c) Enterprises should be assisted to work out simple & workable productivity programmes.

129. In the discussions that followed after the presentation of the two papers, the seminar participants cautioned that there was need to be careful when using mathematical formulae in calculating productivity. They also querried the method that is used to measure the productivity in the whole economy. They doubted whether it was proper to take into account the value added and leave surplus or to take into account surplus only. They also noted that it was difficult to determine whether productivity had increased in monopolistic institutions like the National Bank of Commerce. The participants observed that at present the National Productivity Council is concerned with productivity issues in the modern sector alone. They expressed the need to find ways of measuring productivity in all sectors of the economy.

130. They noted that productivity in the industrial sector had fallen largely because of poor planning and mismanagement. In the social sector some public institutions had stopped doing what they were supposed to do. For example, the ministry of works was no longer building houses,

instead it was using contractors. They expressed the need to strengthen these institutions both financially and in terms of manpower. It was also necessary to encourage industrial engineering and work-study for better management and productivity enhancement. They went on to note that the Economic Revival programmes in Tanzania had helped to raise productivity, so there was need to sustain these measures. Regarding employment, they argued that if there is overmanning, retrenchment is necessary. But before retrenching the workers, arrangements had to be made to find ways of making the retrenched workers productive.

(g) Session 7

STRATEGIES FOR IMPROVING WORKERS' PRODUCTIVITY
WORKERS' PERSPECTIVE

131. Mr. Raymond J. Kyoma made a presentation under this item. He said that the paper looked into the use of productivity of labour as measure of performance connoting that labour is responsible where there is poor performance. After this simplistic analysis, erroneous solutions that call for redundancies were often resorted to. He argued that there was a need to look at costs other than labour and to see how they affected performance in terms of surplus and profit generation. Management in their role of entrepreneurs were responsible for performance.

132. He went on to define the meaning of productivity and levers to higher productivity. Productivity he said is a ratio of output to inputs. The structure of inputs/costs affect productivity and performance.

133. Entrepreneurship is the fulcrum of productivity and performance. At national level politicians were the national enterpreneurs in that they had to provide a good atmosphere for economic and social development. At enterprise level management was the agent. The skills and know-how of workers and availability of hardware of industry had to be balanced towards productivity enhancement.

134. Mr. Kyoma then examined the state of productivity in Tanzania. Productivity had been affected by several factors that had no direct connection with either entrepreneurial capability or internal policies pursued by Party and Government. These were rising prices of oil; deteriorating terms of trade, break-up of the East African Community, War of Iddi Amin; Climatic factors and over dependence of the economy. Consequently productivity had been very low and often declined in the period prior to 1986.

135. He also discussed questions of Education of the Labour force. He observed that illiteracy was high even with the Universal Primary Education (UPE) and Adult Education programmes. It was sometimes manifested in lack of knowledge about the environment and exposure. Illiteracy was highest among females, especially in rural areas.

136. Self-sufficiency in manpower (middle and high level) had been achieved to the level of 80 percent by 1980 official evaluation. But manpower misallocation had tended to exist.

137. Further, he examined the efforts made by the government to increase productivity. These included the adoption of Professor Turner's recommendations of 1966 and establishment of several institutions; PLT, SCOPO, NIP and NPC and the expansion of Vocational training.

138. He listed a number of productivity problems in the formal, informal and agriculture sectors which include:

a. Over dependency of the economy
b. Institutional role conflict (a case of Kilombero Sugar Company) in productivity enhancement
c. Economic Infrastructure
d. Inadequate infrastructure
e. Improper pricing
f. Low pay
g. Costly structure of government.

139. He then suggested measures to solve low-productivity problems. Better macro-economic policies to improve the formal, informal, and agricultural sectors by removing monetary and fiscal policies that create rigidities and liquidity problems to firms were needed.

140. As regards improvement of productivity in the formal sector, Mr. Kyoma identified six measures, namely:

a. Improvement of the entrepreneurial function
b. The National Policy on Productivity, Incomes and Prices should be operated by the social partners (Workers' and Employers organisations) and removal of interferences by other institutions be effected eg. SCOPO.

c. Condition of workers in Estates and Plantations should be improved in terms of better housing, sanitary conditions, water and health & safety improved wages and child care.

d. Inculcation of the culture of consensus in the government to recognise the importance of tripartite solution by involving and consulting the worker's and employers' organisations. The culture of consensus is necessary towards strengthening workers' participation at enterprise level.

141. In the informal sector, the following measures were proposed:

a. Provision of skills by the NVTC
b. Make tools, equipment available at relaxed tax by government
c. Improve credit facilities
d. Improve cooperative knowledge and the role of Trade Unions.
e. Provision of Advisory Services to informal producers.

142. In the agricultural sector he suggested that

a. Irrigation tehcniques be more widely applied
b. There should be prompt availability of inputs at competitive taxation rates
c. Marketing and payment to farmers, should be facilitated
d. The function of cooperatives should be streamlined.

(h) Session 8

"AN OVERVIEW OF WORKER PRODUCTIVITY IN TANZANIA 1986 - 1989

143. Mr. L.W. Simonje Shimwela then made a presentation under this discussion item. The state of productivity particularly labour productivity in the economy during the period under review was spelt out. A definition and description of the concept of productivity and its related elements of labour output and input and how it was computed quantitatively was made. In addition, it was shown that labour, be it managerial or operative, was of significant value in the productivity equation. This was because labour manipulated all other factors (land, capital, utilities, etc.) and at the same time was the eventual beneficiary from any gains that resulted from efficiency effectiveness in the production process.

144. He observed that the downward productivity trend experienced in the early 1980's had bottomed out and had improved marginally in almost all the Sectors during 1986 - 1989 mainly as a result of Government's implementation of the Economic Recovery Programme since 1986. However, in spite of these improvements, the modest gains in productivity risked being compromised by the extremely low salaries and wages paid to workers.

145. Sectors of noteworthy achievement were listed as being large Scale Agriculture, Trade, Financial Services, construction and Public administration. To illustrate the significance of these achievements he mentioned that the abundance of food or availability of say, consumer goods was evidence of productivity gains in both the agricultural and trade sectors.

146. The Manufacturing and Public Administration Sectors were singled out for their poor performance due to poor planning and management bottlenecks associated with foreign exchange shortages which affected input import capacity as well and liquidity problems due to the freezing of credit facilities.

147. He briefly examined each sector's contribution to GDP as well as its capacity to generate wage employment. With regard to sectoral contribution to total GDP the high performances were Financial service sector (13%) although on the average it only absorbs about 3% of the total labour force, Public Administration (12%) and large scale Agriculture (9%). With regard to employment generation, Public Administration, Manufacturing and large scale agriculture were first, second and third in that order.

148. In the discussions following the presentations, the Seminar participants observed that the size of the government was big and the pay the employees were getting was very low. The employees also lacked the equipment to work with. They noted that the size of the government had increased because of the decentralisation policy which sought to bring decision making to the people themselves. The negative effect of this contributed to the decrease in productivity. They observed that the other factors which also contributed to the fall in productivity included the pricing system and the cooperatives which were imposed by the government instead of being started by the members themselves. There were external factors also which contributed negatively to productivity like the shortage of foreign exchange.

149. The participants noted that the measures taken by the government to increase productivity included the structural Adjustment Programme and the Economic Recovery Programme.

150. In discussing the setting of production targets in producing organisations, the participants observed that target should be set when there is full capacity utilisation.

151. Regarding the problem of unemployment, some participants felt that sending the jobless to the rural areas was not a solution. Everybody has his/her own inclinations and talents. What is needed is to help him/her develop his/her talents and to create an enabling environment in the rural areas. They also expressed the need to do constant research to better understand the changing aspirations and expectations of the youth in the rural areas.

152. Others noted that apart from agriculture, there were other sectors in the rural areas which could provide employment. These include water and road construction. Public works in these sectors could be undertaken by villagers instead of being undertaken by the Ministry of Works and Water.

153. The participants also observed that there was need to use appropriate technology, i.e. technology for effective production in agriculture, especially under this competitive environment, rather than the labour intensive technology. They also saw the need to professionalise agriculture.

154. The participants also felt that education for Self Reliance still had not this far succeeded in helping to better integrate the youth in their environment. They observed that there was need to assess its effectiveness.

PRESENTATION OF WORKING GROUP REPORTS

The Group Rapporteurs presented their respective group reports as follows:

Group 1: Policies and Programmes
Group 2: Institutions
Group 3: Training

The plenary considered these reports and adopted them as contained in Annex II

ADOPTION OF SEMINAR REPORT

The seminar considered its Report and adopted it.

CLOSURE

The Chairman thanked participants for their hard work and seriousness over the five days of the seminar. He then declared the seminar closed.

GROUP 1

Topic: POLICIES AND PROGRAMMES FOR EMPLOYMENT CREATION AND PRODUCTIVITY ENHANCEMENT IN TANZANIA

Terms of Reference:

- recommend any economic policy measures that may be instituted to stimulate a faster rate of employment growth and productivity increase within the economy;

- recommend supportive programmes to be adopted to solve the problem of unemployment in Tanzania including measures aimed at stimulating the private, informal, agricultural and formal sectors and addressing the special needs of youth, women, and rural producers.

Members:
- Dr. J. Wagao - Chairman
- Mr. H. Mukumb
- Mr. J. Uiso - Rapporteur
- Mr. M. Ndimbo
- Mr. B. Katani
- Mr. H. Mrango
- Mrs. D. Ibrahim
- Mr. L.W. Simonje
- Mr. Mwenisongole
- Mr. G. Chissanga

GROUP 2

Topic: TRAINING FOR EMPLOYMENT

- recommend measures to increase effectiveness of training for employment including ways of upgrading present training effectiveness and measures for increasing training capacities and relevance;

- propose programmes to address the special needs of youth, women informal and agricultural sector workers.

Members:
- Mr. P. Kyoma - Chairman
- Mr. E. Maenda - Rapporteur
- Mr. G. Kombe
- Mr. A. Hauli
- Mr. J. Mwebesa
- Mr. H. Kamote
- Mr. C. Tupa
- Mr. H. Makundi
- Mr. E. Mayawalla
- Mr. E. Kwelukilwa

GROUP 3

Topic: IMPROVING THE EFFICIENCY OF EMPLOYMENT PLANNING AND LABOUR ADMINISTRATION IN TANZANIA

- recommend measures to improve the efficiency of employment planning and labour administration institutions addressing problems of co-ordination, monitoring and implementation, staff and other resource constraints.

Members: Prof. R. Baguma - Chairman
Mr. Mumwi - Rapporteur
Mr. W. Itala
Mr. Engerson
Mr. Masare
Mr. U.P.K. Tenende
Mr. G. Saidi
Mr. P. Luhanjo
Mrs. Ntabajana
Mr. A.W.R. Mwaisumo

GROUP 1
POLICIES AND PROGRAMMES FOR EMPLOYMENT CREATION AND PRODUCTIVITY ENHANCEMENT IN TANZANIA

A. EMPLOYMENT CREATION

1. The Group observed that employment creation in Tanzania has recently been constrained by the poor performance of the economy over the past ten or so years. This is reflected in low GDP growth, declining per capita and general deterioration in the provision of social services.

2. The public sector has long been the major formal employer. But given the size of the labour market today, the public sector can no longer assume the same role.

3. In view of these observations, the group recommends that

3.1 Deliberate measures should be taken to revise existing policies that have been in place to create a more conducive policy environment with a view to creating employment opportunities both in the formal and informal sectors.

3.2 With regard to public sector, it is recognized that avenues for employment creation are presently limited. Nevertheless, as rehabilitation programmes come into force, increased employment opportunities should accompany increased capacity utilization. More employment benefits should parallel proper implementation of the National Investment Policy.

3.3 The Informal Sector should be effectively supported and promoted. In these women's participation deserves special attention. Thorough studies should be carried out to identify the exact magnitude and the main characteristics and problems facing the sector.

3.4 Also, the formal private sector should be given due recognition and promoted within the context of the National Investment Promotion Policy. There should also be periodic review of the operations of private investors from the perspective of enhanced employment opportunities.

3.5 Regarding the youth, it is recommended that universal education be shifted from Standard VII to Form IV. This would enable sufficiently mature entrants to the labour force. Also, proper implementation of youth policies should be adequately supervised by an appropriate government machinery.

B. PRODUCTIVITY ENHANCEMENT

1. The group observed the low level of productivity that has characterised the Tanzania economy over the last ten or so years. This is reflected in the poor performance of various sectors as well as enterprises. To overcome this problem and enhance productivity the following are proposed:

1.1 Creation of a productivity culture through the following measures:

(a) Sensitization of managers, supervisors and workers to the importance of increased efficiency and productivity in the production process.

(b) Productivity education for workers and introduction of productivity science in the school curriculum.

(c) Relating increased renumeration to work performance.

(d) Training of the existing manpower in various and relevant skills.

(e) Strengthening of institutions responsible for productivity management and improvement.

(f) Provision of more material incentives motivation.

(g) Proper manpower allocation to encourage and promote efficient and effective utilization.

1.2 Promoting Productivity at the Sectoral Level

Industry: Measures should be taken to encourage intersectoral co-ordination and linkage, e.g. project co-ordination with sectors which provide services like, electricity, water, telecommunication. Target setting should take into account the realistic ability and technical competence to achieve the desired goals and market availability for the products.

Agriculture:

(a) Small holder: Measures should be taken to effect:

- Prompt procurement and payment
- Correct signals
- Adequate remuneration

- Efficient transport of agriculture and other goods
- Technical package (inputs, extension)
- Competition in agricultural marketing
- Reduction of the workload of women in the rural areas

(b) Large Scale Farming:

Commercially viable large scale production should be encouraged in crops which are in short supply and have a potential market.

(c) Livestock

- Government should strengthen the extention services
- Promotion of Veterinary Clinic Centers.

(d) Public Administration
Measures should be taken to minimize wasteful expenditure in the public sector.

GROUP 2
TRAINING FOR EMPLOYMENT

Introduction

The Group, during the deliberations, saw the need to clear the misunderstanding regarding the concepts of existing between education and training.

The two terms, it was agreed, should not be interchangable for the purpose of employment. Education was as it were, a foundry, while training was equated to tool making. A foundry cannot determine the type of tool to be made although it can influence the quality of that tool. Thus the group came up with the following:

EDUCATION

Primary Education
Observations:

Education, especially after Education for Self-reliance policy was announced has been turned and mixed with training. With the notion that primary education is increasingly terminal for many, the government has introduced vocational subjects to prepare the graduates for self-employment. The graduates from this system have tended to miss both, education and training. Some of them fail even to read and write. On the other hand the graduates are looked upon by their parents and relatives as being prepared to take up wage employment and generate income to the family.

In addition, to that the implementation of Universal Primary Education (UPE) twelve years before the scheduled date (1977 instead of the projected 1989) had constraints on various resources such as teachers, teaching materials, classes etc. This compounded the problem of quality of education provided.

Studies conducted so far have shown that the policy of education for self-reliance has failed to meet its objectives.

Recommendations:

(i) There is need to revisit the policy of education for self-reliance with a view to ensuring that primary education only concentrates on the provision of basic formal education - the three "R"s, and that training for acquisition of skills should take place after primary education.

(ii) Education for Self-Reliance aims at making the youth, not schools, become self-reliant at the end of their schooling. Farming and handcraft, therefore, should be part of the relevant subjects taught; instead of making them extra curricula activities.

(iii) The whole procedure of recruiting teachers for Primary schools should be reviewed with a view to taking those with the necessary qualities. The engagement of Primary school leavers as teachers for such classes as std. V - VII should be abolished or discouraged.

(iv) Deliberate efforts by the Ministry of Education should be made to ensure that the existing teachers are upgraded.

(v) The syllabus and its contents should be reviewed and made more consistent.

(vi) The government should have deliberate efforts to make the rural areas more attractive for the graduates from the educational system.

Secondary Education
Observations:

Studies have shown that the policy of education for self-reliance has not met its objectives. The vocationalisation of secondary education and the introduction of biases i.e. agriculture, commerce, technical biases have not met their objectives.

Studies have shown that there is no relationship between the biases and allocation of students to jobs after completing Form IV. Those joining training do not show any difference in performance from those who do not. On the other hand, those who take a particular bias are not necessary assured of places in training institutions like MATI, (for agriculture bias), etc.

It has also been found out that there are no biases at senior secondary schools (Form V-VI). So the education given up to Form IV may have no relationship with the post secondary education, training and job opportunities.

Recommendations:

(1) There is need to revisit the policy of education for self-reliance.

(2) Secondary education should remain academic and should have no biases. It should not be vocationalized.

(3) Schools should be equipped with the necessary resources such as the right number and quality of teachers, teaching materials and environment to attain the highest standards.

Training
Observations:

It was observed that at present there is no long term perspective policy/plan on training needs and that training was not centrally coordinated leading to proliferation of training institutes and underutilisation of the installed capacity of the training institutes. It was also observed that as a result of this uncoordinated approach industry has not been fully involved hence the long term needs of industry and the role of industry in training have not received emphasis.

Recommendations:

1. There is need to have a long term perspective policy and plan on training which will take into account the future needs of the country and chart out the roles of all organs involved.

2. There should be established a central body e.g. National Training Board which will centrally plan and coordinate training. This is in recognition of the uncoordinated approach which has been taken by Utumishi, NATTAC, NAMDAC, ACHET and the National Vocational Training Council.

3. There is need to orient training to enterprise needs (enterprise based training) and there is need to fully involve industry (public and private) in the provision of resources for training and the management of training institutions. There should be deliberate efforts to make industry finance training by creating the appropriate institutional arrangements to facilitate the interaction between training institutions and enterprise.

4. There is need to establish a National Training Board to administer the training levy which is hitherto collected by the Treasury but not ploughed back into training. Such a board should also introduce other forms of levy to enable industry to jointly finance training and motivate industry to train.

SPECIAL NEEDS OF YOUTH, WOMEN, INFORMAL AND AGRICULTURAL SECTOR WORKERS

Observations:

The group observed that there exists at present uncoordinated efforts by various ministries with the same target group but these efforts have not met the special needs of youth, women, the informal and agricultural sectors. It was observed that the Post Primary Technical Centers under the Ministry of Education, the Folk Development Centers (FDC) under the Ministry of Local Government and the Vocational Training Centers under the Ministry of Labour had no central coordination they had the same target group. This led to underutilization of training capacity.

It was further observed that some programmes like those of FDC's and the Farmers Training Centers did not fully involve women since they provide residential training which does not encourage full participation of women.

Recommendations:

1. Training for the special needs of youth, women, the informal and agricultural sectors should be centrally planned and coordinated under the proposed National Training Board.

2. The training for these special groups should have a central standardisation and certification so that at national level the training and achievements are not of differing standards.

3. There is need to have a needs-based approach to training to facilitate design of programmes which enable women to follow them and participate fully. This would include taking training programmes to where women are so as to encourage their participation.

4. The initiatives taken by local and international organizations e.g. the Entrepreneurial Development Fund (EDF) and the ILO Improve Your Business Programme of training small entrepreneurs should be supported materially and should be encouraged to integrate entrepreneurial training in their activities so as to reach more in the informal and agricultural sectors.

5. Government should encourage local communities/cooperatives, industry, etc. to establish post - primary training centres related to skills and employment promotion on a self-help basis and with substantial public and NGO support.

6. Government should be aware of any emerging pressures to divert resources away from training at the University or post-secondary levels in favour of basic education. All efforts should be made to sustain the effort to train manpower of relevance to Tanzania's socio-economic transformation.

GROUP 3
IMPROVING THE EFFICIENCY OF EMPLOYMENT PALNNING AND LABOUR ADMINISTRATION INSTITUTIONS IN TANZANIA

A. The Nature of the Problem in Employment Creation

1.0 There is employment planning but it is inadequate because it does not address itself to the optimal deployment and utilization of the whole labour force. These inadequacies are reflected in:

(a) the way planning fails to address itself to the whole issue of promoting self-employment and enhancing productivity in the rural areas resulting in rural-urban migration especially for the youth; and

(b) the mismatch between population growth, production, and economic growth.

1.1 For the rural sector, the cause for this phenomenon is the lack of an enabling environment, i.e. poor infrastructure, lack of credit facilities to buy inputs and tools, inadequate pricing and marketing systems, inappropriate skills and entrepreneurial capacity, use of outdated tools and inappropriate technology in production, and the erratic supply of inputs which lead to low labour productivity and low income, thus making the sector repelling.

1.2 For the urban sector, there is:-

(a) open unemployment and underemployment due to the labour force exceeding job openings available;

(b) the existence of informal activities;

(c) the failure of the central allocation system to place all students from secondary schools and institutions of higher learning into jobs; and

(d) the increase in crime, drug abuse, etc.

These are caused by:

(a) the sluggishness of the formal sector (both public and private) in creating enough job openings;

(b) stringent credit facilities for the common man;

(c) lack of a coordinating mechanism to link the institutions which provide finance and those which need it including providing information as to the availability of resource and where they are; and

(d) cultural trappings due to the African extended family system.

B. Nature of the Problem in Labour Administration

1.0 Labour administration refers to the administration of the labour force through various ways e.g. mobilization, incentive packages, etc. to make it more productive.

1.1 In the rural sector.

(a) there is no organizational capacity, and support mechanism for providing an enabling environment;

(b) the responsible government agencies lack power, resources and a mechanism for accountability;

(c) there is lack of an effective popular participation in decision making.

1.2 In the urban formal sector.

(a) there is rampant misallocation, misutilization of manpower;

(b) low wages and inadequate incentive schemes to stimulate higher productivity;

(c) poor or lack of working facilities and tools;

(d) inadequate job analysis resulting in poor job descriptions, sanctions, and accountability regimes for performance appraisal;

(e) inadequate skill development;

(f) lack of a proper and well functioning labour market information system and adequate labour administration;

(g) long bureaucratic procedures for labour administration e.g. in giving promotions; and

(h) the existence of a gap between policy formulation, planning, implementation, and monitoring.

1.3 The urban informal sector is too heterogeneous and disorganized and currently there exists an ineffective and/or weak agency to organize, mobilize, and support it.

C. Recommendations:

1.0 The government has to recognize the importance of employment planning and labour administration and give it support and its proper place in priority and should ensure that the relevant institutions concerned with the implementation of employment planning and labour administration issues should be sensitized as to the magnitude of the problem and the scope and horizon in which it can be tackled.

1.1 The Planning Commission should exercise its statutory powers and mandate to formulate policies, plan, monitor, review, direct and support the implementing agencies in solving and minimizing the above mentioned problems.

DAILY WORK PROGRAMME

DAY 1: 15/10/1990

9.00 - 10.00 a.m.	- Registration
10.00 - 11.00 a.m.	- PLENARY - Opening Statement by Principal Secretary, Labour, Culture and Social Welfare - Statement by ECA - Statement by ILO
11.00 - 11.30 a.m.	- Coffee/Break
11.30 - 12.30 p.m.	- PLENARY - Policies, Machineries and Programme for Employment, Chief of Jaspa Mr. Diejomaoh
12.30 - 01.00 p.m.	- Discussions
01.00 - 02.30 p.m.	- Lunch Break
02.30 - 03.30 p.m.	- PLENARY - The Problem of Unemployment in African Countries - ECA Representative
03.30 - 04.30 p.m.	- Strategies for Improving Labour Absorptive Capacity of the Public, Private and Informal Sector Dr. M. Bagachwa
04.30 - 05.00 p.m.	- Discussions
05.00 p.m.	- Coffee/Tea

DAY 2: 16/10/1990

08.30 - 09.30 a.m.	- PLENARY - An overview of the Tanzania Economy Mr. S. Odunga
09.30 - 10.30 a.m.	- Discussion
10.30 - 11.00 a.m.	- Coffee/Tea Break

11.00 - 12.00 p.m.	-	PLENARY _ Policies, Machinery and Programmes for Employment Creation in Tanzania 1. Prof. R. Baguma 2. Mr. D. Dandi
12.00 - 01.00 p.m.	-	Discussions
01.00 - 02.30 p.m.	-	Lunch Break
02.30 - 03.30 p.m.	-	PLENARY - Training for Employment Dr. F. Mukyanuzi - Creation
03.30 - 04.30 p.m.	-	Discussions - Mrs. D. Ibrahim
04.30 p.m.	-	Coffee/Tea

DAY 3: 17/10/1990

08.30 - 09.30 p.m.	-	PLENARY - Women and Employment
09.30 - 10.30 a.m.	-	Discussions
10.30 - 11.00 a.m.	-	Coffee/Tea Break
11.00 - 12.00 p.m.	-	PLENARY
09.00 - 10.30 a.m.		- Improving the Efficiency of Employment Planning and Labour Administration Institutions in Tanzania Mr. W. Itala
12.00 - 01.00 p.m.	-	Discussions
01.00 - 02.30 p.m.	-	Lunch Break
02.30 - 03.30 p.m.	-	PLENARY
03.30 - 04.30 p.m.	-	Discussions
04.30 p.m.	-	Coffee/Tea

DAY 4: 18/10/1990

08.30 - 09.30 a.m. - PLENARY
- Strategies for Improving Workers Worker Productivity
  Mr. R. Kyoma
- Participation of Women in Employment in Tanzania by A.I.A. Mwenisongole

10.30 - 11.00 a.m. - Coffee/Tea Break

11.00 - 01.00 p.m. - Discussions

01.00 - 02.30 p.m. - Lunch Break

02.30 - 04.30 p.m. - Group Discussions
- Group 1: Policies and Programmes
- Group 2: Institutions
- Group 3: Training

04.30 p.m. - Coffee/Tea

DAY 5: 19/10/90

08.30 - 10.30 a.m. - Group Discussions

10.30 - 11.00 a.m. - Coffee/Tea Break

11.00 - 01.00 p.m. - PLENARY
- Preparation of Group Reports Disuccions

01.00 - 02.30 p.m. - Lunch Break

02.30 - 04.30 p.m. - Presentation by Group Repporteurs and general disucssion

Adoption of the Seminar Report

04.30 - 05.30 p.m. - Concluding Remarks and Closure

SEMINAR ON EMPLOYMENT GENERATION AND WORKER PRODUCTIVITY ENHANCEMENT IN TANZANIA

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

1. Mr. U.P.K. Tenende
   Acting Director
   Planning Commission

2. Mr. C. Grey-Johsnon
   Economic Affairs Officer
   ECA

3. Prof. V.P. Diejomaoh
   Chief of JASPA
   ILO, Addis Ababa
   Ethiopia

4. Mr. R. Gilbert
   ILO Expert
   Ministry of Labour Culture
   and Social Welfare

5. Mr. Engerson
   ILO Consultant
   Ministry of Labour Culture and
   Social Welfare

6. Prof. P.N. Dussault
   professor
   University of Ottawa
   Canada (UNDP Office)

7. Mr. Z. Minja
   Training Officer
   USAID
   Dar es Salaam

8. Dr. J.H. Wagao
   Economist
   Foreign Affairs and
   University of Dar es Salaam

9. Mr. J.T.M. Uiso
Manager (Statistics)
Bank of Tanzania

10. Mr. E.K. Kwelukilwa
Senior Economist
Planning Commission

11. Mr. W.L. Itala
Senior Manpower
Planning Officer
Planning Commission

12. Mrs. D.A. Ibrahim
Assistant Secretary-General
Jumuiya ya Wanawake

13. Mr. Lewis W. Simonje
Senior Productivity Analyst
National Productivity Council

14. Mr. G.S. Saidi
Principal Managn. Officer
Civil Service

15. Mr. G. Ntabajana
Planning & Strategy Manager
SIDO

16. Mr. B.B.C. Mumwi
Principal Manpower
Planning Officer
Ministry of Health

17. Mr. J.G. Mwebesa
Principal Asst. Secretary
C.C.M. Headquarters

18. Mr. G.S. Kombe
Asst. Director
(In-plant Training)
Ministry of Labour

19. Mr. H.D. Kamote
Economist
Planning Commission

20. Mr. A.I.A. Mwenisongole
TUTOR
JUWATA

21. Mr. E. Mayawalla
Manpower Planning and
Development Manager
National Insurance Corporation

22. Prof. Rweikiza Baguma
Professor
IDM Mzumbe

23. Dr. M.S.D. Bagachwa
Senior Research Fellow
University of Dar es Salaam

24. Mr. P.L. Luhanjo
Clerk to the Cabinet
President's Office
State House

25. Dr. F. Mukyanuzi
Asst. Director
Planning Commission

26. Mr. A.W.R. Mwaisumo
Asst. Director
Planning Commission

27. Mr. A.J. Masare
Senior Economist
Ministry of Labour

28. Mr. H.E. Mrango
Asst. Director
Planning Commission

29. Mr. Bedda H. Katani
Asst. Director
Planning Commission

30. Mr. Humson Makundi
Asst. Director
Planning Commission

31. Mr. A.J. Hauli
Asst. Director
Planning Commission

31. Mr. A.J. Hauli
Asst. Director
Planning Commission

32. Mr. Henry S. Mkumbi
Principal Manpower
Management Officer
Civil Service Dept.

33. Mr. M.M.K. Ndimbo
Economist
CCM Head Office

34. Mr. C.K. Tupa
D M D A
Planning Commission

35. Mr. A.T. Maenda
Executive Director
Association of Tanzania
Employers

36. Mr. A.G.K. Mwakapugi
Principal Economist
Planning Commission

37. Mr. John B. Tucker
Programme Officer
UNDP

38. Mr. P.C.T. Mayeye
Assist. Govt. Statistician
Planning Commission

39. Mr. R.J. Kyoma
Director Research
Union of Tanzania Workers

40. Mrs. S.P.K. Maliyamkono
Public Relations Officer
National Institute for
Productivity

41. Mr. George Chissanga
Director
Agr. & Natural Resources
Planning Commission

SECRETARIAT

42. Mr. Gaspar B. Kanja
Senior Manpower Planning Officer
Planning Commission

43. Mr. George D. Yambesi
Senior Manpower Planning Officer
Planning Commission

44. Mr. J.B. Mwinuka
Senior Manpower Planning Officer
Planning Commission

45. Mr. D.W.M. Kidehele
Manpower Planning Officer
Planning Commission

46. Mr. D.W.M. Kidehele
Manpower Planning Officer
Planning Commission

47. Mrs. B. Kaaya
Personal Secretary
Planning Commission

48. Ms. Hortensia Msoffe
Personal Secretary
Planning Commission

49. Mr. E.P. Makamba
Accounts Assistant
Planning Commission